

REPORT DATE: 11 February 2026 **REPORT NUMBER:** ES005-26
DEPARTMENT: Engineering Services
PORTFOLIO HOLDER: Cr Julia Spicer
REPORT TITLE: **COMMERCIAL IN CONFIDENCE - RFT2526-30 Goondiwindi SPS1 Renewal**
PREPARED BY: Manager Water and Sewerage, Mr Adam McMahon

SUBJECT:

Council has recently called tenders via Vendor Panel for the renewal of Sewerage Pump Station 1 in Goondiwindi (SPS1). This report is for Goondiwindi Regional Council to consider the Tenders submitted for RFT2526-30 Goondiwindi Sewerage Pump Station 1 (SPS1) Renewal works.

REPORT:

The requirement to upgrade Goondiwindi SPS1 was identified as it was refurbished at the same time and by the same contractor as Goondiwindi SPS2, which suffered a failure requiring emergency works last financial year. In addition to these refurbishment works to mitigate the risk of a similar failure this pump station also presents operational and WHS issues due to the building located over the wet well pit. As part of these works this structure is to be removed to allow easier access to remove and install pumps as required for servicing and / or replacing. Failure of the station would likely have a major impact on service continuity, pose potential environmental harm, and significantly higher costs to Council if works were required on an emergency basis.

A Request for Tender (RFT) to supply and undertake construction of the Goondiwindi SPS1 upgrade was called via Vendor Panel as an Open Market Tender in compliance with Council's Procurement Policy. The Tender closed on Wednesday, 21st January 2026.

The following Tenders were received (in alphabetical order):

Contractor Name	Amount (GST Incl.)
CNC Maintenance	\$ 664,508.36
Heaton Plant & Pipeline	\$ 648,325.04
Utilstra Pty Ltd	\$ 967,823.79
Protective Films Australia Pty Ltd	Non-conforming

Four submissions were received by the closing date. As the quoted value of works is above \$280,000, Council's procurement policy requires Council to make a decision regarding the award of this contract.

The Tender submissions were evaluated against the evaluation criteria by three internal staff and an external consultant. Three submissions met the tender requirements however, the submission from Protective Films provided promotional material only and did not address the scope or mandatory tender requirements. This submission was deemed non-conforming and was excluded from evaluation. The three conforming submissions were assessed in accordance with Goondiwindi Regional Council's procurement policy and the evaluation criteria outlined in the tender documents.

The Evaluation Matrix results are provided as **Attachment A**.

It is important to note with critical water & sewerage infrastructure the approach and proposed methodology is the most critical component of projects such as this where we are working with a major sewerage pump station in the Goondiwindi sewer network, and as such price only scores 20% of the total project scoring and past performance, methodology and expertise making up 50% of the project

scoring. The priority is to get the best outcome with the least risk on continuity of service to the community and this does not always equate to the lowest priced submissions.

Following a comprehensive evaluation of all conforming submissions, the evaluation team determined that while Heaton Plant & Pipeline submitted the lowest price, their proposed methodology was high-level and generic, with only basic deliverables identified. Their experience in comparable works provided demonstrated limited experience in projects of a similar nature and complexity, increasing the risk of delivery issues during construction.

In contrast, CNC Maintenance submitted a detailed and well-considered methodology that met all project requirements and demonstrated a clear understanding of the scope, constraints, and operational risks associated with the works. CNC Maintenance has undertaken similar infrastructure projects to a high standard, including works previously delivered for Council, providing confidence in their capability to successfully deliver this project.

A key component of the works involves the removal of the existing building over the pump station. While most submissions proposed demolition of the structure, CNC Maintenance's submission demonstrated an enhanced approach by proposing to preserve the building through relocation in partnership with the Goondiwindi Customs House Museum. This would enable the creation of a dedicated interpretive display recognising the building's architectural value, its role in the region's development and history, and the community it served. Unfortunately during discussions at a workshop of Council this wasn't a preferred outcome and should CNC be successful it may require a slight variation to their tendered price to demolish and dispose of the building, however this is yet to be discussed with them.

CNC Maintenance's submission reduces project risk through demonstrated experience and a robust methodology, while also delivering additional community outcomes, representing superior overall value for money despite not being the lowest price submission.

The amount tendered by CNC Maintenance is below the project budget and will also remain below the budget when staff and external consultants costs are allowed for.

It is therefore recommended that Council *accept the best scoring conforming tender from CNC Maintenance for RFT2526-30 Goondiwindi SPS1 Renewal for the amount of \$664,508.36 (GST Incl.)*

Budgets are GST exclusive and it is also recommended that Council reduce the overall Goondiwindi SPS1 project budget to \$750,000.

ASSOCIATED RISKS:

The key risks associated with this project include potential delays or quality and structural standard issues during construction, safety risks to staff while removing existing infrastructure, service disruption from pump station downtime, and cost overruns if works are poorly managed or require emergency intervention. These risks are mitigated by awarding the contract to a contractor with proven experience, a detailed methodology that meets all project requirements, and a demonstrated ability to deliver similar works to a high standard.

FINANCIAL IMPACTS:

The total approved project budget is \$900,000 and is in the 2025/26 Capital Works Program. While this portion of the works falls within the approved budget allocation, additional internal costs and associated works—such as project management, third-party technical consultancy, will be incurred. When these additional costs are factored in the total project costs are expected to be well within the approved budget and as such it is also recommended that Council reduce the approved budget to \$750,000.00

CONSULTATION:

Elite Aqua
Goondiwindi Museum

LEGISLATION/LEGAL/POLICY:

- *Local Government Act 2009*
- *Local Government Regulation 2012*
- *GRC Capital Works Budget 2025/2026*

OFFICER'S RECOMMENDATION:

That Council accepts the best scoring conforming tender from CNC Maintenance for RFT2526-30 Goondiwindi SPS1 Renewal for the amount of \$664,508.36 (GST Incl.)

That Council reduce the overall Goondiwindi SPS1 renewal budget to \$750,000.00

ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment A: RFT2526-30 Goondiwindi SPS1 Renewal - Evaluation Matrix

ATTACHMENT A – RFT2526-30 - Evaluation Matrix

OFFER DETAILS											
Number:	RFQ2526-30										
Name:	Goondiwindi SPS1 Upgrade										
Closing Date:	4pm 21/1/26										
Contract Type:	Contract Above \$280,000 - Price and Criteria										
EVALUATION PANEL MEMBERS											
Evaluation Panel Member 1	Manager W&S	Adam McMahon									
Evaluation Panel Member 2	W&S Technical Officer	Tony Cover									
Evaluation Panel Member 3	W&S Project Officer	Monika White									
Evaluation Panel Member 4	Elite Aqua	Tim Brown									
SUBMISSIONS RECEIVED											
Weighted Scoring (Non-Price)											
Criteria	Maximum score	Weighting %	CNC		Leaton Plant & Pipelin		Utilstra		Protective Films		
			Average Score	Weighted Score %	Average Score	Weighted Score %	Average Score	Weighted Score %	Average Score	Weighted Score %	
Contractor Experience and Qualifications	5	25	4.50	22.50	1.75	8.75	3.75	18.75	0.00	-	
Methodology and Technical Expertise	5	25	4.25	21.25	2.25	11.25	3.75	18.75	0.00	-	
WH&S Systems	5	10	4.00	8.00	3.00	6.00	4.25	8.50	0.00	-	
Availability	5	10	4.75	9.50	3.00	6.00	2.75	5.50	0.00	-	
Local Benefit - Local Supplier/Contractor	4	5	1.00	1.25	1.00	1.25	1.00	1.25	0.00	-	
Local Benefit - Local Content	4	5	2.25	2.81	0.75	0.94	0.75	0.94	0.00	-	
Total Weighting Percentage (Non-price)	80										
Total Weighted Score (%)			65.31		34.19		53.69		-		
Weighted Scoring (Price)											
Submitted Price			\$ 664,508		\$ 648,325		\$ 367,824				
Lowest Price	\$ 648,325										
Total Weighting Percentage (Price)	20										
Total Weighted Score			97.50		100.00		50.72				
Total Weighted Score (%)			19.50		20.00		10.14				
TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE & RANKING											
Total Weighted Score (%)	100		84.81		54.19		63.83				
Ranking			1.00		3.00		2.00				

